

**CABINET RESPONSE TO THE 'IMPROVING CARDIFF'S AIR QUALITY
'REPORT PUBLISHED BY THE ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY
COMMITTEE SEPTEMBER 2018.**

Recommendation 1

Task group recommends that improving public health should be documented as the primary reason for introducing a Clean Air Strategy in Cardiff.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

From the outset of the work to develop the Clean Air Strategy (CAS), it was agreed with the working group that the overarching aim of the CAS was to Improve and protect Public Health. This is clearly established and set out in the CAS which has formed the foundations of the Council's Full Business Case published in line with Welsh Government's Legal Direction.

Recommendation 2a

The Council continues to work with and lobby the Welsh Government for a clear direction and guidance on the next steps to take in terms of achieving air quality compliance 'in the shortest time possible'.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

Direction was issued to the Council, dated 14th February 2018 (actually received 8th March 2018). Officers set up regular meetings with Welsh Government officials in order to ensure that the Council undertook the feasibility study in accordance with appropriate guidance issued from Welsh Government or from the Joint Air Quality Unit at Defra. Final Plan was submitted in accordance with the Direction.

Recommendation 2b

Ask the Welsh Government to provide financial assistance to undertake the feasibility study and to deliver the option identified to improve air quality in the feasibility study

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

Funding to undertake the feasibility study was provided by Welsh Government and confirmed in writing.

In terms of implementation the preferred option to deliver compliance, the Council submitted its Final Plan to Welsh Government on the 28th June 2019, in line with the requirements of the Direction. The plan has been reviewed by the Welsh Government's expert panel and the Minister approved Final Plan subject to additional clarifications being provided no later than the 31st October 2019.

Recommendation 2c

Employ suitably qualified experts to deliver the feasibility study and help implement the option identified in the feasibility study to improve air quality.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

From the outset of the feasibility study, the Council secured the services of Ricardo Energy and Environment (Ricardo) to ensure the feasibility study was completed to the highest technical and quality standards. Ricardo are seen as the leading AQ consultants in the UK and have been working with a number of Core Cities who have been following similar legal directions to complete feasibility studies.

In addition to Ricardo the Council also procured the services of Mott Macdonald (through Transport for Wales (TfW)) in order to provide detailed transportation modelling required to assess future roadside emissions and to assess the impact of the measure being considered to deliver compliance.

Recommendation 2d

Waste no further time in carrying out the feasibility study – the EU air quality limits need to be addressed by either 2022 or in the soonest time possible. The evidence presented suggests that feasibility studies take about two years to deliver and at the point of writing this report the Council had not started its feasibility study for Cardiff.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted but also refuted

Following the legal Direction received March 2018, work began immediately on Feasibility Study, with the initial proposal issued to Welsh Government by March 31st 2018 detailing how the Council intended to undertake the feasibility study. Further, the previous work on developing CAS was the catalyst to identifying a long list of measures to consider as part of the feasibility study.

Recommendation 3

Task group recommends that the new clean air strategy cites the reduction of nitrogen dioxide from diesel vehicles as one of its key aims and that whenever possible actions resulting from the clean air strategy specifically reflect this aim.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

CAS identified NO₂ as the primary source of air pollution in Cardiff, and strategic measures identified in the strategy looked to reduce NO₂ as a primary target objective in order to protect public health.

In addition, the Direction from Welsh Government required the Council to achieve compliance with EU limit Value for NO₂ in the shortest possible time and thus the Direction further ensured that reduction in NO₂ is essential.

However, it should be noted that other pollutants particularly particulate matter (PM_{2.5} and PM₁₀) have also known significant health impacts and thus ultimately the CAS looks to improve all air pollutant concentrations and not just NO₂.

Recommendation 4

The task group recommends that we consult and work with neighbouring local authorities to develop the Clean Air Strategy and supporting action plan to improve air quality.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

A full public consultation took place on the preferred option for the feasibility study which also included the Clean Air Strategy document. Work will progress with neighbouring authorities in implementing the White Paper.

Recommendation 5

Should the feasibility study recommend some type of clean air zone, congestion charging zone, or low emission zone as the way forward the Council should not be afraid to implement the decision as it will ultimately help achieve its biggest existing transportation target.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is partially accepted

As part of the requirements to meet the legal direction and inform the decision to progress with a preferred option to address the documented non-compliant air quality levels, those suggested options (Package of non-charging measures/ Charging Clean Air Zone) have been cross referenced and assessed against the three Garnham tests;

1. Aim to achieve compliance as soon as possible;
2. Choose a route to compliance which reduces human exposure as quickly as possible; and
3. Ensure that compliance with the limit values is not just possible but likely.

Following the comparative analysis Cardiff Council supported the decision to proceed with a revised package of non-charging measures as its preferred option.

The findings of the assessment outlined that a CAZ does not meet the requirements of 2 Garnham tests;

- It will not achieve compliance in shortest time possible as its feasibility for implementation is uncertain. Likelihood is that an operational CAZ would not be in place until end 2020/ Q1 2021. Comparatively the package of non-charging measures will be implemented in a shorter amount of time and associated improvements in air quality levels will be evidenced almost immediately (Q1 2020); and
- It will not reduce exposure as soon as possible. As outlined the envisaged timeframes for an operational CAZ would not see exposure reduced between

now and implementation date. The delivery of the package of non-charging measures will reduce exposure once implemented in late 2019 through to 2020.

It needs to be reiterated, in line with the legal direction; compliance must be achieved in the shortest possible time for the highlighted non-compliant road link only, this being Castle Street.

As detailed in the FBC, owing to the particular road link of non-compliance, it was deemed that a wider CAZ would not be interpreted as proportionate to the area of non-compliance. Subject to viable evidence it could be assumed that a wider CAZ could generate geographically wider air quality improvements, however the project must remain honest to the Direction's objective and deliver a mitigation option which coincides with the projections derived from 2021 baseline understanding, thus being only 1 road link of non-compliance.

Results of final plan indicated that a package of non-charging measures have greater benefit in terms of AQ improvement and public health protection. This is because while NO_x rates would fall in the CAZ itself as modelled, rerouted traffic outside the CAZ would have an adverse impact significantly outweighing any benefits seen in the CAZ itself.

However, it is not to say that the Council should not further consider the implementation of a CAZ or congestion zone/ road user charging scheme, should the necessity arise to use said schemes to support further reductions in air pollution or to provide mechanism to enhance/ implement wider transportation projects.

Recommendation 6

The task group recommends that the Council look into the feasibility of creating a low emission neighbourhood in an area of Cardiff with the worst air pollution levels. It could act as a pilot for trialling air quality improvement initiatives and would be a first of its kind for Wales.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is rejected

The results of the feasibility study has identified Castle Street as the area within the City anticipated to show future non compliance with the EU Limit value for annual average NO₂. The results of the modelling undertaken correlates well to non-automated measurements for NO₂ results collected on Castle Street, and the locality of the City Centre Air Quality Management Area (AQMA). As such, the measures proposed to improve air quality levels whilst initially targeting Castle Street have also been modelled in terms of a city wide impact.

Recommendation 7

The task group recommends that the Council continues to lobby the Welsh Government for clear direction and financial support, and that it invests as much money and effort as possible to drive air quality improvements across the city.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

The Council submitted its Final Plan (FBC) on the 28th June 2019, which included a detailed financial case setting out a request of £21.2m funding to implement a package of measures. Full details of the funding case put forward are included in the Final Plan and we are continuing to work with Welsh Government to secure this funding.

Recommendation 8

The task group recommends that the Planning Service reviews its existing supplementary planning guidance in relation to managing air quality and implementing sustainable fuel infrastructure alongside the development of the Clean Air Strategy.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

Shared Regulatory Services (SRS) have developed a draft version of a Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) for Cardiff Council. This document is subject to review and approval

In addition, the Planning Team have already produced a new SPG on the requirements for EV Infrastructure on new developments.

Recommendation 9

The task group recommends a review into the wider traffic and pollution implications of new developments. This should include a review of traffic modelling techniques and how planning obligation monies can be applied across a wider area to deal with the impact of traffic and pollution.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

The implementation of this recommendation is dependent on the scale of the development, and any requirements for an Air Quality Assessment (AQA). SRS already request that cumulative impacts of large developments are considered when agreeing the scope of the AQA with developers/ consultants.

SRS ensures that AQA comply the requirements of Institute of Air Quality Management (IAQM) /Environmental Protection UK (EPUK) Planning Guidance for AQ assessments. This will be further enhanced through a revised SPG on Air Quality.

The use of planning obligation monies across wider areas can be consider but would be subject to agreement of local members agreeing wider expenditure.

Recommendation 10

The task group recommends that the Planning Service takes advantage of these expert resources (NRW/ PHW) as and when required.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

SRS officers already liaise with PHW/ NRW colleagues on major applications and elsewhere as necessary. SRS have recently been successful in securing funding from NRW to implement further NO₂ monitoring at a number of schools in Cardiff.

Recommendation 11

The task group recommends that the Council notes the urgency of required change to meet air quality targets and does all that it can to deliver and then promote its existing transport proposals.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

The Council has noted the urgency of the change required to meet air quality targets, most notably the EU limit value for NO₂ to comply with the legal direction from Welsh Government. This is reflected in the ambitious plans set out in our Final Plan and the challenging programme for implementation.

In addition, the CAS will deliver further on-going and long term continuous improvements not only for NO₂ but other key pollutants. The Council's White Paper set out the Council's long term visions for transportation improvements not only in Cardiff but across the City Region as a whole.

Recommendation 12

The task group recommends that the Council should increase its focus on the affordable short-term measures within its control.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

Current focus is on the Feasibility study and developing and implementing the preferred option detailed in the Final Plan and agreed with WG. Additional measures including anti idling zones, green infrastructure/ Living walls can be taken forward as part of wider Clean Air Strategy but will of course be subject to appropriate funding being available.

Recommendation 13

The task group recommends that monies raised from existing or proposed traffic / parking control measures is reinvested directly back into transport infrastructure.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

This already occurs and will continue to do so.

Recommendation 14

During the task & finish exercise Members were informed that the Council is due to publish 'Cardiff's Transport & Clean Air Green Paper' in the spring of 2018. The Environmental Scrutiny Committee would welcome the opportunity to scrutinise this document once it becomes available.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

Recommendation 15

Completion of the Cardiff Central Transport Interchange. The task group urges the Council to work with developers to complete this facility 'in the soonest time possible'. As an interim measure, the Council should republish and distribute the map that was made available when the old bus station was first closed.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

The planning permission for the ITH was approved in November 2018, and construction is due to commence imminently with a scheduled opening date in early 2023. In terms of the maps detailing location of services/ stops in the interim period, we will work in conjunction with Cardiff Bus and other operators to ensure accurate and up to date information is available to passengers.

Recommendation 16

The Council continues with improvements and on-going development of dedicated walking and cycling infrastructure, for example, by accelerating the development of segregated cycle lanes in Cardiff;

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

Cardiff Council are developing proposals for five Cycleways to support and promote cycling for all ages and abilities. The proposed routes will connect communities to major destinations across the city, including the City Centre and Cardiff Bay.

Cycleways will provide continuous routes that are intuitive and comfortable to use and separated from motor vehicles and pedestrians where needed.

The Cycleways will be developed from proposals in the Integrated Network Map which sets out a 15 year plan to improve routes for walking and cycling in the city.

The proposed Cycleway routes are:

Cycleway 1: City Centre to Cathays, University Hospital Wales, Heath High Level and Heath Low Level Rail Stations, and North East Cardiff Strategic Development Site

Cycleway 2: City Centre to Adamsdown, Newport Road retail parks, Rumney, Llanrumney and St Mellons Business Park

Cycleway 3: City Centre to Cardiff Bay

Cycleway 4: City Centre to Llandaff, Danescourt and North West Strategic Development Site

Cycleway 5: City Centre to Riverside, Ely and Caerau.

Following a public consultation in 2018 works have been commissioned and commenced on Cycleway 1 on Senghennydd Road.

Recommendation 17

The Council, public sector partners, major employers and For Cardiff (the Cardiff BID) should do all it can to encourage their staff to use active travel to get to work and carry out day to day trips whenever possible.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

Working initially through Cardiff Public Services Board, a Healthy Travel Charter for Cardiff has been developed with major public sector employers and was launched in April 2019. Signatories to the Charter make 14 commitments on improving access to active and sustainable travel for staff and visitors to their main sites, and jointly commit to three targets namely:

- Reduce the proportion of commuting journeys made by car;
- Increase the proportion of staff cycling weekly; and
- Increase the proportion of vehicles used for business purposes which are plug-in hybrid or electric.

The Charter was signed by 11 public sector organisations at launch in April 2019, employing over 33,000 staff, with additional public and private sector organisations subsequently invited to sign up to the Charter.

Currently it is not possible to fully assess the impacts of the above the measures but it is envisaged that such measures will contribute to wider behavioural changes and incentives to encourage further modal shift or uptake of low emission vehicles which will see improvements in air quality.

Recommendation 18

Car parking is an important factor in managing travel behaviour, the task group recommends that the Council should:

- Consider gradual increases in public car parking charges in city centre areas as public transport options are improved.

The funding raised by the public parking charges should then be used to pay for and accelerate improvements in active travel facilities and public transport;

- Run a consultation on private parking facilities in the city to identify how much it is used and to understand the impact that it has on businesses, congestion and air quality;
- Consider what the Council can do to manage the large amount of private parking in Cardiff, for example, a review of the planning process around car park development to encourage modal shift;
- Review the option of introducing a workplace parking levy to Cardiff. Nottingham has successfully introduced a workplace parking levy which has increased modal shift and raised significant funds (£44 million) for transport initiatives in the city;
- Consider variable parking charges to correspond with traffic parking demand when next reviewing the parking charges within the Parking Revenue Account;
- Develop further methods to encourage 'For Cardiff (Cardiff BID)' members and their staff to use the park & ride facilities offered by the Council - if successful this would help reduce traffic movements into the city.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is partially accepted

The Council has powers to review the amount it charges residents for on road parking permits. An assessment should be made of the potential impact of introducing a sliding scale of permit charges based on the emission standards of vehicles, which would see a significant reduction in permit costs for EV/OLEVs, in order to encourage and expedite the uptake of such vehicles. Such measures have already been implemented in a number of Local Authorities in England.

Similar measures will also be considered at Council Car Parks and on Street Parking locations, whereby the most polluting vehicles would be charged a premium parking rate.

Managing Transportation Impacts (Incorporating Parking Standards) SPG

This SPG sets out Cardiff Council's approach to assessing and managing the transport impacts of developments and supplements the transport and other related policies in Cardiff's Local Development Plan 2006-2026. It applies to all categories of development for which planning permission is required, including new developments, extensions, redevelopments and material changes of use.

The SPG provides detailed guidance with regard to:

- 1) How the Council will consider the impacts of development on the routes that make up the local highway network.
- 2) The detailed information that applicants for planning permission should include with their submissions to enable the Council to make a fully informed assessment of transport impacts.
- 3) The Council's approach to quantifying and assessing the transport impacts of development proposals as part of its determination of planning applications.

- 4) The types of transport infrastructure and other mitigation measures which may be sought to address transport impacts.
- 5) How the Council will seek to secure the transport infrastructure and other transport measures required to mitigate transport impacts, enable development to proceed and support the implementation of Transport policies in the Local Development Plan.
- 6) The scope and content of Travel Plans required as part of the overall package of measures to mitigate impacts and support the implementation of LDP transport policies.
- 7) The parking standards which apply to different types of development in specific areas of the city.
- 8) How the impacts of developments upon Public Rights of Way will be considered and the likely requirements for mitigation.

Recommendation 19

- The Council makes a clear statement that sets out the Council's ambitions for taxi emission standards in the city and explains out how this might be achieved, for example, Nottingham has stated that it wants to significantly reduce taxi emissions in the city by converting all of its taxi fleet to electric by 2025;
- The Council needs to work with Cardiff's taxi companies and drivers to establish and implement a reasonable timescale to set a minimum emissions standard for taxis operating in the city, with the new minimum emissions standard being built into the existing licensing policy. To support this change the Council should work with the taxi companies and drivers to identify potential financial assistance to 21 deliver the change, for example, an approach could be made to Welsh Government asking for support – such transitional support has been provided in cities like Dundee, Derby and Birmingham;
- Taking the Welsh Government Taxi Consultation into consideration the Council should review the use of the 'Exceptional Conditions Policy' and wider 'Taxi Licensing Policy' to make sure that it is fit for purpose and complies with the aim of improving air quality in the city;
- The Council needs to work closely with the taxi companies and drivers to ensure that parking or blocking of bus lanes stops. It should be made clear that enforcement action will be taken by the Council against any drivers who block the bus lanes. The task group recommends that any driver found blocking a bus lane should be fined and ultimately have the privilege removed if they persist in doing it. In return for this support, the Council should acknowledge that the number of Hackney Carriage licences greatly exceeds the number of taxi rank spaces and carries out a review of

taxi rank facilities in the city centre. It would be appreciated that any response to this recommendation is supported by a series of proposed actions and agreed timescales as this matter has been raised at previous scrutiny meetings during the last twelve months.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is partially accepted

The improvement of the age/ emission standards of the private hire/ hackney carriage fleet operating in Cardiff is a long standing improvement which will take time and effort to fully implement. The Council is proposing to improve the emission standards of the City's licensed vehicles. Subject to consultation response and Public Protection Committee (PPC) approval (Scheduled for December 2019), Cardiff Council wishes to implement a taxi licensing policy change to improve emission standards for licensed taxi vehicles in Cardiff.

The policy change will require all new grants and renewals for licensed vehicles to have a maximum age limit of 5 years. In essence this will require all **new** grants/ renewals to meet Euro 6 emission standards.

As part of the feasibility study initial grant scheme to target initial 620 taxis to apply with ULEV - equivalent to £3k per driver over 3 years.

With regards to the enforcement of taxis stopping/ blocking bus lanes a pilot enforcement project has commenced in Mill Lane. This is scheduled to run for 3 months, with a view of expanding enforcement to key City Centre locations, including St Mary Street, Castle Street, and within the vicinity of CIA to be considered.

With regards to allocating EV charging points for taxi ranks, the Council have procured a contractor to undertake work focussed on promoting the uptake of electric taxis by taxi firms and self-employed drivers, in order to reduce air and noise pollutants being released into communities. They have been in contact with the trade asking for taxi vehicles (being both private hire and hackney licenced vehicles) to have a tracker fitted for up to a 4 week period in order to provide a drop off and pick up 'heat map' which will enable the Council to prioritise EV charging infrastructure in order to support taxi operators in Cardiff wishing to adopt EVs.

Recommendation 20

As a part of the task & finish exercise Members met with a number of bus company and passenger group representatives. It was clear from discussion that they understood that overall bus emission levels needed to fall to help improve air quality, however, to achieve this substantial and ongoing financial assistance would be required from the public purse. Several references were made to the lack of Welsh Government funding to support bus services in Wales; this was in contrast to the support offered other parts of the United Kingdom and indeed to the rail network. Other issues discussed during the meeting included emission levels in the city centre; bus company business planning and investment in future vehicles; the introduction of low emission buses; park & ride and bus

lane infrastructure and a single ticketing approach. Based on the evidence gathered, discussion at the meeting and the key findings the task group recommends that:

- The City Centre Air Quality Management Area (predominantly based around Westgate Street) has the highest levels of nitrogen dioxide concentrations in Cardiff - this is significantly impacted by approximately 140 bus movements per hour. It is estimated that buses account for 56% of the nitrogen dioxide emissions and that 63% of the bus movements in the Westgate Street area are from vehicles that are Euro 4 or less. To provide some context the Euro 5 standard was established on the 1st September 2009; this means that over half of the bus movements in Cardiff's worst polluted street are from vehicles that are approaching ten years of age or more. This local air pollution problem is compounded by the canyon nature of the street. Members of the task group believe that air quality improvements are urgently required in this very busy area and recommend that the Council should work with local bus companies to explore the feasibility of restricting older buses from the area. Options that should be considered might include the creation of a 'greener bus route' or developing a low emission zone in the area that might exclude buses that fail to meet a specified emissions standard, for example, Euro 6. The Members of the task group acknowledge the challenges that this might present to local bus companies, however, such restrictions have been applied in other parts of the country and have dramatically reduced nitrogen dioxide emissions.
- Bus companies should be asked to work with the Council and provide a business plan to illustrate how they plan to reduce bus emissions for bus journeys in the Cardiff in the next three years. This would correspond with the timescale for achieving compliance with the EU air quality limits and help provide focus on the role that they have in 23 helping to achieve this target.
- In terms of financial support to reduce bus emissions it is clear that Welsh bus companies are a poor relation when compared to their Scottish and English counterparts. Government funding has been put in place in other parts of the United Kingdom to help support the transition to cleaner buses, while the Welsh Government in comparison has provided very little. The Council should support the local bus companies by lobbying the Welsh Government for financial assistance for bus services in Cardiff and Wales.
- There are no low emission buses operating in Cardiff or indeed Wales. The Council should do what it can to bring a low emission bus to the Capital City, for example, supporting a major bus provider to procure and introduce

one or more hydrogen buses would be a very positive step forward.

- The Council should continue with its development and promotion of Park & Ride and bus lane infrastructure across the city. These are essential in driving modal shift and will be a key ingredient in supporting the wider Metro effort. Effective bus lanes help reduce journey time and improve punctuality – this in turn breeds confidence and convenience into the system, important for delivering modal shift. To compound this park & ride journeys should be punctual, quick and direct. Members were aware of park & ride journeys that made multiple stops between the park & ride facility and city centre – this adds time and makes the park & ride journey less attractive compared to using the private car, on this basis the Committee recommends that all park & ride journeys should be direct, i.e. not feature additional stops.
- Bus and train services in Cardiff should work towards a single ticketing approach in the South East Wales Region. Introducing this in line with the new Metro developments would appear to be a good opportunity and the functionality of the ticket should be similar to that of the London 24 Oyster Card.
- The Council should work with local bus companies and consider the potential option of introducing bus mounted transponders onto buses using bus lanes to enter and exit the city. In doing this feedback should be sought from the Swansea bus lane transponder scheme where they are used to send a signal to traffic lights before the bus actually arrives at the light. The signal changes the traffic light in favour of the bus to allow it to proceed smoothly without having to wait as standing traffic. This makes the bus journey quicker and ultimately more reliable – two important characteristics in helping to increase bus patronage.

RESPONSE: The Recommendation is partially accepted

In 2018 SRS along with Cardiff Council's Transport team collaborated with Cardiff Bus company to put forward a successful bid application for the Ultra-Low Emission Bus (ULEB) fund made available by the Department for Transport (DfT).

The proposal draws links between the air quality management areas (AQMAs) identified under the LAQM regime, as well as the issued direction from Welsh Ministers which targets Cardiff on the regional scale highlighting non-conformities in association with European Directives. Therefore linking the two together; due to the heightened profile of air quality and its potential adverse impact on public health, and given Cardiff's Local Air Quality Management scenario, as well as its regional air quality concerns it is imperative that short term measures, such as increasing the uptake of low emission buses are implemented as soon as possible to start the process of achieving compliance with the air quality objectives.

The bid application looks at acquiring a total of 36 electric buses that would be introduced to the Cardiff Bus fleet over a three year cycle. The uptake of 36 ULEV buses will result in 15% of the Cardiff Bus operator fleet being certified as Ultra Low Emission. The introduction of the electric buses would form part of a cascade programme whereby Euro 3 standard buses would be offset from the fleet completely, therefore improving the overall fleet composition.

It is envisaged that the roll out of the electric vehicles will begin in the 1st quarter of 2020.

Owing to the previously offered Department for Transport's (DfT) Clean Bus Technology Fund (CBTF), subject to legal advice surrounding State Aid, Cardiff Council's Clean Air Project Team proposes to function as a regulatory entity to manage, regulate and fund such a retro fit scheme with Cardiff based bus operators.

The retro fit programme would see applicable bus vehicles fitted with the necessary upgrades to produce an emissions output equivalent to a Euro VI vehicle. Replicating the conditional criteria outlined in the DfT's CBTF, to successfully qualify for the provided funding it is a main requirement that those vehicles identified for the accredited technology upgrades are expected to be operational for a further 150,000 miles or operational for minimum of 5 years after the relevant upgrades.

Following the discussions with senior representatives from the various operators, Cardiff Council received a good level of positive interest and commitment. To date **150 bus vehicles** applicable to proposal have been identified. These vehicles operate solely in Cardiff or Cardiff based routes, therefore they will positively attribute to improving roadside emissions in Cardiff.

If the uptake of the retrofit scheme is not sufficient to provide the modelled air quality benefits then the Council will need to assess the possibility of introducing a Low Emission Zone (LEZ) for Buses. This would require buses operating in the LEZ to have minimum emission standard of Euro 6/ equivalent retrofit or ULEV, which would look to increase the uptake of the scheme.

Such a zone would be achieved by applying to the Traffic Commissioner to issue a Traffic Regulation Condition (TRC) which applies to the license of bus operators providing services in Cardiff. A TRC would be issued under the Regulation 7 of the Transport Act 1985¹, whereby Regulation 7(4) states that if the traffic commissioner is satisfied, 'after considering the traffic in the area in question that such conditions are required or are likely to be required in order to ...(c) reduce or limit ...air pollution.

The introduction of such zones has been undertaken in a number of Cities in the UK outside of London, including Oxford, Brighton and Glasgow.

Alternatively the Council will work with local operators on the possibility of establishing a Quality Partnership Scheme (QPS) under Section 114 of the Transport Act 2000. Such schemes can be voluntary or statutory and provides looks to improve facilities and services in an agreed area of operation. As part of the QPS, it is possible to stipulate minimum emissions standards that buses operating in the area of QPS would be required to meet, i.e., Euro 6 retrofit or ULEV.

¹ <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/1985/67/contents>

As part of the supporting works to facilitate the feasibility study, a detailed understanding has been documented for the potential impacts generated by improvements to the bus fleets operating in Cardiff.

Recommendation 21

The committee feels that when the Council is assessing the economic benefits of allowing cruise liners to dock it should also factor the environmental impact that they might create into the overall assessment.

RESPONSE: The Recommendation is rejected.

The Council confirms that there are no ports or shipping that meet the specified criteria cited within the necessary local air quality management guidance to deem further assessment of relevant air quality pollutants.

Recommendation 22

Sustainable Fuels Strategies

This recommendation is in fact a series of sub-recommendations, focusing on increasing sustainable fuel infrastructure:

- a) The Council continues with the development of its Sustainable Fuel Strategy**
- b) The Council works with and lobbies Welsh Government to create a sustainable fuel strategy for all of Wales.**
- c) The Council engages with other local authorities in the South East Wales region to encourage them to create and publish sustainable fuel strategies.**
- d) The Council engages with its public sector partners across the South East Wales Region to encourage them to create and publish sustainable fuel strategies.**

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted.

- a) The Council has developed its sustainable fuels strategy.
- b) Welsh Government Published [Prosperity for All: A Low Carbon Wales](#) in March 2019 which sets out the Welsh Government's approach to cut emissions and increase efficiency in a way that maximises wider benefits for Wales, ensuring a fairer and healthier society and thus there is no need to further lobby Welsh Government on this.
- c) The City Region has been working on a Sustainable/ Alternative Fuel Strategy and work is ongoing with Cenex to produce this work and the Council has been working with the region on this.
- d) Working initially through Cardiff Public Services Board, a Healthy Travel Charter for Cardiff has been developed with major public sector employers and was launched in April 2019. Signatories to the Charter make 14 commitments

on improving access to active and sustainable travel for staff and visitors to their main sites, and jointly commit to three targets namely:

- Reduce the proportion of commuting journeys made by car;
- Increase the proportion of staff cycling weekly; and
- Increase the proportion of vehicles used for business purposes which are plug-in hybrid or electric.

The Charter was signed by 11 public sector organisations at launch in April 2019, employing over 33,000 staff, with additional public and private sector organisations subsequently invited to sign up to the Charter.

Recommendation 23

The task group recommends that the Council should work with local car dealerships to encourage the growth of electric, hybrid or hydrogen vehicle sales.

RESPONSE: This recommendation is rejected.

Whilst the intention of this recommendation is fully appreciated, the Council is not able to influence how private businesses such as car dealerships market alternative fuelled vehicles. However in developing its Clean Air Feasibility Study and Clean Air Strategy the Council has worked directly with the SMMT to develop an increase awareness of alternative fuelled vehicles, and will continue to do so. The Council's ambition is to encourage a significant modal shift from the dependency private cars.

Recommendation 24

The Council should work with the motor industry to bring a trade show for electric, hybrid or hydrogen vehicles to Cardiff.

RESPONSE: This recommendation is rejected.

As per the previous recommendation, the Council's focus is on improving sustainable transport to encourage a significant modal shift from private vehicles.

Recommendation 25

The Council has recently commissioned a report that aims to identify the best way forward for electric charging infrastructure in the city. The task group recommends that the Council considers and evaluates the content of the report before deciding on how to roll out electric charging infrastructure to the city.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

In 2018 Arcadis Consulting (UK) Ltd supported by Zero Carbon Futures (UK) Ltd were commissioned by Cardiff Council to prepare a feasibility study to explore how electrically powered Ultra Low Emission Vehicle (ULEV) charging points could be

integrated across the city of Cardiff. As the market share of ULEV is growing and is forecasted to increase significantly over the coming decades, it is critical that the necessary charging infrastructure is provided to facilitate this growth, in order to support a cleaner transport system across Cardiff.

Eighteen new fast EV charging points have been installed in Cardiff as part of a successful bid to the OLEV Residential Charge Point Scheme.

The chargers installed and managed by SWARCO E.Connect form part of a pilot scheme to evaluate the benefit of having EV charging points on street in residential areas.

In line with the requirements of the successful bid, the new 7Kw electric chargers, which fully charge a vehicle in four to six hours have been installed in residential areas, where there is little or no off-street parking.

The Council has set out that over 90 vehicles in the Council's fleet will be converted to either electric or hybrid engines by 2020, with plans to convert the remaining smaller fleet by 2022.

The EV chargers have now been installed and are operational in the following locations:

Canton: One charge point has been installed at Butleigh Avenue, two charging points at Victoria Park Road West and two charging points at Anglesey Street.

Riverside: Two charging points in Turning Head Car Park (Llandaff Fields), two at Severn Road Car Park and one point at Rennie Street.

Cathays: Two charging points on Maindy Road

Plasnewydd: Two charging points at Penylan Library

Penylan: Two charging points at Waterloo Road and two charging points at Stallcourt Avenue.

The Council has made progress in terms of increasing electric charging infrastructure at four main employment hubs. It has been agreed that in 2019/20 for 8 electric vehicle chargers each at County Hall, Lamby Way, Wilcox House and Coleridge Road (i.e., total of 32 chargers).

Recommendation 26

The task group recommends that the Council builds the use of sustainable fuels (such as electric & hydrogen) into the vehicle and wider supply chain procurement process to support the growth of low emission fuels.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted.

Members are referred to the Sustainable Fuels Strategy

Recommendation 27

The task group recommends that the Council needs to review and then do what it can to bring at least one hydrogen refuelling facility to Cardiff.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is partially accepted.

Members are referred to the Sustainable Fuels Strategy.

Recommendation 28

The task group recommends that the Council works with its public sector partners to:

- Agree and work towards setting clear and meaningful targets for air quality improvement;
- Implement air quality strategies and that detail time focused action plans to help achieve air quality compliance;
- Communicate and educate the public on air quality issues;
- Monitoring the progress achieved.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted.

The Council has worked with PSB partners in developing its Clean Air Strategy, and the sub points of this recommendation have all been included in the Council's Clean Air Strategy.

Recommendation 29

The Council and all major public sector organisations should run a programme to encourage their staff to switch to active travel and encourage workplace practices to reduce the number of unnecessary journeys.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted

A Healthy Travel Charter for Cardiff has been developed with major public sector employers and was launched in April 2019.

Recommendation 30

Once the Clean Air Strategy is complete and a clear direction of travel is established the task group recommends that the Council should do all it can to raise the profile of what is being done to improve air quality in Cardiff and explain why it is being done.

RESPONSE: The recommendation is accepted.

In developing the NO₂ plan, the Council undertook a detailed engagement exercise, which involved all identified key stakeholders. A number of public engagement

events were undertaken to promote the Council's plan and advise members of the public on the plan. This involved developing the Clean Air Cardiff the events were heavily promoted via the Council's social media channels.

Further promotion of the Council's plan will be undertaken during the implementation phase once all aspects are agreed with Welsh Government.

Recommendation 31

The Council should support an interactive consultation event during the feasibility study period with its public sector partners and Members of the business community to explain the air quality challenges facing Cardiff.

RESPONSE: - The recommendation is accepted

The above recommendation was implemented as part of the Feasibility study.